

1
3 TWO STEPS FORWARD, ONE STEP
5 BACK: IDEOLOGICAL AND
7 HISTORICAL ASPECTS OF LIBRARY
9 AND INFORMATION SCIENCE
11 EDUCATION IN INDEPENDENT
13 UKRAINE
15

17 Maria Haigh

19 «Книга, могучее орудие общения, труда, борьбы. Она вооружает человека опытом жизни
21 и борьбы человечества, раздвигает его горизонт, дает ему знания, при помощи которых он
может заставить служить себе силы природы»

23 The book is a mighty instrument for communication, labor, struggle. It arms a person
25 with life experiences and the toils of humanity. It expands his horizons and gives him
knowledge to tame the forces of nature.

N.K. Krupskaya, wife of V.I. Lenin

27
29 **ABSTRACT**

31 *This chapter examines historical developments and current trends in*
33 *Ukrainian library education, based on a review of the Ukrainian*
35 *literature, a survey of Library and Information (LIS) curricula, and*

LIS After the Fall: Post-Soviet Institutions and Practices
Advances in Library Administration and Organization, Volume 27, 1–24
Copyright © 2009 by Emerald Group Publishing Limited
All rights of reproduction in any form reserved
ISSN: 0732-0671/doi:10.1108/S0732-0671(2009)0000027006

1 *conversations with senior figures in Ukrainian LIS education. Ukraine*
2 *became an independent state only in 1991 after the collapse of the Soviet*
3 *Union. Prior to independence, Ukraine's LIS education was integrated*
4 *within the Soviet system. After independence the system evolved slowly,*
5 *but with the recent Orange Revolution, reform efforts have increased*
6 *apace. Ukrainian LIS education remains more vocational than in the*
7 *United States, with a two-year nondegree certificate as the most common*
8 *training, and a four-year bachelor's degree offered by elite institutions.*
9 *One emerging trend in LIS education there stresses the new opportunities*
10 *for librarians and information professionals because of Internet techno-*
11 *logies. Another trend is part of a more general shift, inspired by a new*
12 *Ukrainian higher education law, stressing the country's independent*
13 *culture and formalizing standards for different degrees. Although*
14 *Ukrainian LIS leaders advocate adoption of open access mechanisms,*
15 *customer friendly practices, and electronic resources, my own experiences*
16 *as a library user suggest that Soviet-era habits continue to shape library*
17 *practices. LIS education has now reached a turning point as reformers*
18 *grapple with the limited resources, the power of inertia, and remnants of*
19 *Soviet culture in their efforts to meet current challenges and prepare a*
20 *new generation of information professionals. In 1904, frustrated by the*
21 *chaotic state of the exiled Russian revolutionary community, Lenin*
22 *published the book One Step Forward, Two Steps Back (The Crisis in*
23 *Our Party). Fundamental institutional change has never been a quick or*
24 *easy process. More than 90 years after his eventual triumph in the*
25 *October Revolution of 1917, Ukraine is now working to undo Lenin's*
26 *legacy. Its progress has been similarly indirect, but one can at least be*
27 *sufficiently confident about its direction (to reverse the directions*
28 *involved): in recent years the country has been making at least two steps*
29 *forward for each one back.*

RU:1

31
32
33 Within Ukraine's libraries, as in its other social institutions, attempts at bold
34 reform and a decisive break with the Soviet past have struggled against the
35 prevalent culture of passivity and corruption inherited from the Brezhnev
36 era of the 1970s. Ukraine was one of the 15 Soviet republics and was fully
37 integrated within the U.S.S.R until its collapse in 1991. Today, Ukraine
38 struggles quite publicly with the legacy of its seven decades of Soviet
39 misrule. Although the Soviet Union contained one of the world's best-
developed library networks, its libraries were charged with a very different
task from their counterparts in liberal democracies. The ideology of

1 Marxism-Leninism was woven into every state institution and libraries
2 played an important part in shoring up Lenin's legacy. Librarians were
3 educated to ensure that reading and research was conducted according to
4 socialist principles (Kimmage, 1992). Very often libraries were part of the
5 communist-led cultural and entertainment clubs provided by the Ministry of
6 the Interior for the use of members of different occupational groups.

7 Ukraine's history and geography present some particular challenges to
8 librarians. The country has a culturally and historically diverse population,
9 with several languages and national traditions. Today Ukraine has a
10 population that has shrunk to 48 million, though it remains, the second
11 biggest country in Europe (after Russia) in terms of land area. Ukraine
12 borders Poland, Romania, and Moldova in the west, Belarus in the north,
13 and Russia in the east. Until the borders of Europe were redrawn by the
14 1939 Molotov-Ribbentrop Pact (in which Poland was partitioned between
15 Hitler and Stalin), most of present-day western Ukraine was Poland. In this
16 region, Ukrainian (closely related to Russian but with many Polish
17 elements) is widely spoken, and most citizens look toward the European
18 Union for their political future. Eastern Ukraine was the traditional
19 heartland of Ukrainian nationalism and Cossack traditions, but Stalin
20 crushed most resistance through artificial famines, deportation, and the
21 resettlement of ethnic Russians. And so, today, most in the region speak
22 Russian and look toward ever closer ties with Moscow. The Crimean
23 peninsula, in the south of the country, was only merged into Ukraine in a
24 1954 internal shifting of borders within the Soviet Union.

25 Since independence, the use of Ukrainian language has become a highly
26 politicized issue dividing pro-Western politicians from their pro-Russian
27 counterparts. Currently Ukrainian is the nation's only official language, but
28 the vast bulk of existing library materials, and indeed library patrons, rely
29 on Russian. One challenge facing library education is the promotion of
30 Ukrainian language and culture within libraries, a task involving many
31 practical and political difficulties.

32

33 **BRIEF OVERVIEW OF LIBRARY AND REFERENCE** 34 **EDUCATION IN THE SOVIET UNION**

35
36 Vladimir Ilyich Lenin, like George W. Bush, married a woman with a keen
37 personal interest in the promotion of libraries. Nadezhda Konstatinovna
38 Krupskaya was credited with defining the foundations of the content and
39

1 methods of Soviet Library education (Karetzky, 2002). After the 1917
2 Bolshevik revolution, Krupskaya became the country's director of
3 adult education and propaganda and Deputy Commissar of Education.
4 Krupskaya borrowed the German model of multiple tiers in Library and
5 Reference education. This system offered two-year non-degree programs to
6 prepare junior and middle level library specialists and four and five-year
7 higher degrees to prepare higher level specialists (Raymond, 1979).

8 Under Krupskaya's guidance, libraries were reborn as a crucial part of the
9 ideological infrastructure of Soviet society. Krupskaya published a 1920
10 article in *Pravda*, the major newspaper of the new state, titled "Centralization
11 of Librarianship." In this article, she outlined the new place of public libraries
12 in the Soviet Union "In order to provide everybody with books, we need to
13 increase book publication hundred- or thousand-fold. Currently, given the
14 overall collapse of the economy, this is impossible to achieve. Therefore, we
15 have only one solution: to move from individual book ownership to collective
16 book usage. Collective use of books is possible only with the development of
17 the wide network of libraries" (Krupskaya, 1934). Books, like agricultural
18 land and industrial resources, were to pass into common ownership. Soon
19 after Krupskaya's article appeared, the Bolshevik Commissariat issued a
20 directive to confiscate and nationalize all private book collections with more
21 than 500 books "belonging to the citizens whose professions do not require
22 books as proletariat require their tools" (Verzhbizkiy, 1924). Confiscated
23 books were supposed to be moved to the newly created libraries (Fig. 1).

AU:1

24 The collectivization of books within library collections also facilitated
25 Communist party control over their contents. From the very beginning,
26 Krupskaya stressed that only certain books should be made available to the
27 masses. In 1924, she wrote that "There are books that organize and there are
28 books that disorganize" (Likhtenshtein, 1978). As Lenin's wife, she put in
29 place the practice of cleaning these "disorganizing" books from library
30 collections (Verzhbizkiy, 1924). Throughout the Soviet period, librarians
31 were responsible for maintaining up-to-date lists of forbidden works and
32 removing them from public view. As Soviet rule spread to new states,
33 librarians were trained in these techniques and were required to move
34 unsuitable books into "special collections" (Abramov, 1974). Later in the
35 Soviet period, some books purged from libraries would resurface illicitly as
36 Samizdat, passed clandestinely between readers often as self-published
37 copies in handwritten, manually typed, or carbon-copy form (Biriukov,
38 2000; Daniel, 2005).

39 Krupskaya initiated the founding of the first "Soviet Library Seminaria"
(college), which opened in Moscow in 1918, just one year after the



Fig. 1. The Caption Reads “Read according to the system: The library will help you to compile your reading plan”. Propaganda Poster, 1920s.

25 revolution and several years before the final victory of Red forces in the
27 ensuing civil war. This was the first sustained attempt to offer library educa-
29 tion within the former Russian Empire, despite sporadic earlier initiatives to
31 create textbooks and offer instruction in librarianship (Choldin, 1976).
33 Librarians were formerly drawn from a variety of educational backgrounds
35 and were often trained as teachers (Abramov, 1980). Library education
37 became a required subject in the humanities departments of many Russian
39 institutions by the end of the 1920s. At the same time, more than 20 library
departments opened in Russian Institutes of Political Education, Pedago-
gical Institutes, and Academies of Communist Education (Kazanzceva,
1958). From the beginning of the 1930s, the library education system started
to develop in other republics of the Soviet Union. Library departments were
transformed into specialist educational institutes. The first library institute
in Ukraine opened in 1934 in Kharkiv (Kharkov in Russian) in Eastern
Ukraine. Like other early Soviet library educational institutes it was rechar-
tered as a library school after previously serving as a Political-Educational

1 Institute to provide specialist ideological education to new Communist party
members (Kazanzceva, 1958; Sheyko & Kushnarenko, 2004).

3 In the postwar years, the number of library higher education institutes
continued to grow. The network of library institutes spread not only across
5 Soviet republics, but also to the other countries of the Soviet bloc. In 1964,
Soviet library institutes went through another transition and were reborn as
7 Institutes of Culture, positioning library education as the institutional peer
of theater, dance, circus, and cinema education. This reflected the shared
9 role of these professions in providing propaganda mixed with culture and
entertainment. By 1970, the Soviet network of library higher education
11 institutions consisted of 10 Institutes of Culture and more than 20 library
faculties (departments) within universities (Grigoryev, 1975).

13 Here, as in its overall organization of library education, the Soviet Union
followed the German system. Graduate study and the completion of a
15 dissertation led to the Candidate of Sciences qualification (“Kandidat
Nayk” – the equivalent of the American PhD). Studies for the Candidate of
17 Sciences degree occurred in the consortia of universities belonging to the
Academy of Sciences, where students took courses at a number of different
19 institutions. Studies for the Candidate of Sciences degree in the humanities
required courses in four areas: history, philosophy, foreign language, and
21 profession. Librarianship was offered not as a self-contained discipline but
as a specialized series of courses within the “profession” component of this
23 broader educational program. People who studied librarianship as a
professional specialization received the Candidate of Sciences degree either
25 in history or philosophy, or pedagogy. From 1948–1956, Aspirantura
(postgraduate study for Candidate of Science) took place at the Vernadsky
27 National Library of Ukraine, the main information center of Ukraine.
These studies ceased in 1956 after Soviet authorities accused this library of
29 fostering nationalistic sentiment. After 1956, only the Moscow and
Leningrad Institutes of Culture offered graduate research degrees with a
31 librarianship component.

Subsequent completion of a second, larger, and more innovative
33 dissertation, which is the equivalent of the German *Habilitationsschrift*,
would grant the status of “Doctor.” “Doctorants” required strong national
35 and international reputations, and usually headed departments or institu-
tions. Doctorants did not have advisors or take additional courses or
37 examinations, since they themselves often served as advisors to the students
studying for Candidate of Sciences degrees.

39 These specialist library schools offering instruction to candidates seeking
higher degrees were merely the top tier of a much larger system of library

1 education. This concept, too, can be traced back to Krupskaya. The tiered
2 hierarchical system was adopted from the German model even though the
3 content was changed. Within larger libraries, jobs were rigidly stratified
4 according to the level of library education received. Vocational library
5 education initially took place within the political–educational departments
6 of Sovpartshkola (an abbreviation of “Soviet Party School”). Later, fully
7 fledged library education departments opened within the political education
8 faculties of vocational colleges which were two-year schools granting
9 diplomas (Oleneva, 1961). From the beginning of 1929, separate vocational
10 library education schools started to appear. By 1970, the Soviet Union
11 reported a network of vocational library education institutions, which
12 consisted of 12 separate vocational library education schools and more than
13 100 departments in vocational colleges. At that time, the total body of
14 vocational library education students studying librarianship was said to be
15 approximately 30,000 (Grigoryev, 1975). These vocational schools were
16 educating far more librarians than their degree-granting counterparts.
17 Soviet statistics reported that, in the 1968/1969 academic year, 4,000
18 librarians graduated with university degrees, and 11,000 librarians
19 graduated with diplomas from vocational schools (Grigoryev, 1975).

20 As one might expect, given the ideological weight accorded to libraries
21 within the U.S.S.R., the curricula developed for library students stressed the
22 role of the library in the long march toward the eventual realization of a
23 utopian communist society. Librarians were being educated to play an
24 active part in the dissemination of ideological propaganda. All courses had
25 some Soviet ideological components with more than a third of them devoted
26 exclusively to Marxist-Leninist ideology. The curricula of Soviet Library
27 education included the following core components for librarians educated in
28 the institutes of culture and universities:

29

- 30 • History of the Communist Party of the USSR.
- 31 • Marxist-Leninist Philosophy.
- 32 • Political Economy.
- 33 • Foundations of Scientific Communism.
- 34 • Foundations of Marxist-Leninist Ethics and Aesthetics.
- 35 • Foundations of Scientific Atheism.
- 36 • Foundations of Marxist-Leninist Theory of Culture.
- 37 • Pedagogy
- 38 • Psychology
- 39 • History of the U.S.S.R.
- 40 • History of Foreign Countries

- 1 • Russian Literature and Literature of the Soviet Republics
- Foreign Literature
- 3 • Foundations of Library Science
- History of Library Science
- 5 • Foundations of Librarianship and Reference
- Collection Management
- 7 • Cataloguing
- Working with Readers
- 9 • Soviet Library Organization
- History of Books
- 11 • Reference Librarianship
- Special Library Reference
- 13 • General Foreign Reference

RU:2

15 Elite librarians being trained to work within special libraries received
 17 additional courses. These included history of the Soviet economy, history of
 19 technology, fundamentals of modern natural sciences, fundamentals of
 modern industrial production, and “technical propaganda and informa-
 tion” (Grigoryev, 1975).

LIBRARY AND REFERENCE EDUCATION IN UKRAINE AFTER THE COLLAPSE OF THE SOVIET UNION

25 Opportunities to create national schools in library science presented
 27 themselves only with Ukraine’s independence, which took effect at the
 start of 1992. The new Ukrainian Constitution guaranteed the democratic
 29 principles of intellectual freedom and free and equal access to information.
 The new constitution had a positive influence on library democratization,
 31 expansion of professional contacts, and collaboration between librarians
 (Konyukova, 2002a, 2002b). Democratization of Ukraine became one of the
 33 driving forces in effecting changes in library science education. In 2002, a
 new law implementing new standards for higher education came into effect.
 35 This law established standard requirements for bachelor’s, master’s, and
 doctoral degrees. These replaced the old standards defined by the centralized
 37 system of the U.S.S.R.

39 With the collapse of the Soviet Union, the required courses in Marxist
 ideology rapidly vanished from Ukrainian degree programs. However, the
 creation of a modern and democratically inclined library culture required

1 rather more than simply jettisoning the overtly ideological chunks of the old
2 curriculum. Rapid change would have required a rapid and fundamental
3 shift in educational personnel, teaching materials, learning styles, organiza-
4 tional culture, and professional identity. This was not possible. In fact, the
5 immediate effect of independence was a sharp drop in available resources
6 for both libraries and education as the Ukrainian economy imploded and
7 centralized Soviet infrastructure networks unraveled. During the chaos of
8 the early 1990s, universities struggled simply to pay instructors and to keep
9 the lights on. As one Ukrainian library specialist summarized the era,
10 “Economic crisis in Ukraine led to a sharp decline in library networks,
11 student enrollment and graduation of new specialists” (Khlynova, 2001).

12 According to one Ukrainian observer, “Before [independence in] 1992 no
13 periodical journal of librarianship existed [in Ukraine]” (Mozyrko, 2002).
14 Scholarship in the field was centered in Russia. Soviet centralization left
15 newly independent Ukraine without a single graduate library school
16 (Mozyrko, 2000). As a result, the lack of library and information (LIS)
17 science researchers with graduate research training focused on the discipline
18 has been a particular challenge to the expansion of graduate education in
19 the field. However, Ukraine inherited a reasonable complement of voca-
20 tional and undergraduate library training programs.

21 The main structural difference between the Ukrainian and the American
22 library education systems remains the multitiered hierarchical system of
23 education in Ukraine, which contrasts dramatically with the American
24 model in which the graduate MLIS degree is the main professional
25 credential recognized by the field. Library and reference education in
26 Ukraine still follows the German–Soviet model and consists of two tiers.
27 The first tier prepares junior level library workers in vocational two-year
28 schools. There are two levels of vocational schools. Vocational schools
29 at the lower level (level I of accreditation) accept applicants at the age of
30 14–15. At graduation, students receive a vocational certificate and the
31 equivalent of a high school diploma. Vocational schools at the second level
32 (level II of accreditation) accept applicants at ages 17–18 from a variety of
33 academic backgrounds. At the end of two years of studies, graduates receive
34 a professional certificate for the middle level library worker (Golovko,
35 2003). There are many vocational schools in Ukraine to prepare junior and
36 middle level library specialists. Programs are offered in different formats:
37 day-study, evening-study, and correspondence classes (Demchyna, 2003;
38 Golovko, 2003).

39 The second tier of Library and Reference education consists of four and
40 five-year colleges and universities (III and IV levels of accreditation).

1 Library and Reference departments operate within a university, or Institute
2 of Culture, or within degree-granting teacher training colleges (“Pedagogical
3 Institutes”). After independence, many colleges that had previously been
4 called institutes renamed themselves as universities. After completing these
5 colleges, graduates receive the equivalent of a bachelor degree. Four
6 Ukrainian schools grant bachelors’ degrees in Library Science, covering the
7 main geographical areas of the country:

- 8 • The Kyiv National University of Culture and Arts (Central Ukraine).
- 9 • The Kharkiv State Academy of Culture (Eastern Ukraine).
- 10 • The Rivne State University of Culture (Western Ukraine).
- 11 • The Mykolaiv branch of the Kyiv National University of Culture and
12 Arts (Southern Ukraine).

13
14 During Soviet times, the place of natural science and engineering at the
15 top of the academic status hierarchy was unquestioned. Their prestige was
16 boosted both by the state’s strategic commitment to science as a showpiece
17 of Soviet accomplishment and to the relative lack of ideological distortion
18 imposed on the work of researchers in these fields. Librarianship was
19 grouped with other professional, artistic, and social science fields as part of
20 “the humanities.” Even within the humanities it suffered from an unusually
21 low level of prestige. The ideological mission given to libraries during the
22 Soviet era cost them much respect in the eyes of both library users and
23 librarians. Because undergraduate library schools were located within
24 Institutes of Culture and were responsible for the creation and dissemination
25 of propagandistic entertainment, they enjoyed a lower status than other
26 professional disciplines. This mitigated against the emergence of a strong
27 culture of research in the field (Mozyrko, 2000). From the 1950s onward,
28 leading library schools and ambitious researchers in the United States
29 remade themselves as practitioners of “information science,” embracing the
30 mantle of science, the rigors of quantitative and experimental research, and
31 the power of new electronic technologies in an attempt to legitimize the field
32 as a modern and theoretically grounded endeavor. Information science
33 eventually edged out librarianship as the dominant identity in the field.
34 Library education in the Soviet Union, in contrast, remained closer to its
35 vocational roots. Within the institutes of culture, it was institutionally allied
36 more with the performing arts than with new ideas such as information
37 retrieval or information theory that predominated elsewhere. Soviet library
38 specialists do not seem to have enjoyed appreciable success in making a
39 similar claim to scientific status for their field.

1 This situation has been slow to change. Today, Kyiv's (Kiev in Russian)
3 only undergraduate library education program is at the Kyiv National
5 University of Culture and Arts, a former Soviet institute of culture. This
7 university offers education in singing, dancing, hairdressing, and the hotel
9 industry as well as professional studies, such as law and business. Library
11 education, formerly one of the three main divisions of the institute, has been
13 demoted to a Department ("kafedra") of Information Resources and
15 Services within the university's School ("institute") of Culture. Its peer
17 departments within this school include the Department of Applied Cultural
19 Studies offering degrees in stage training, fashion, tourism, and the rather
21 cryptically titled "psycho-technology of the entertainment and recreation
23 industry." The university heavily promotes its performing arts programs, as
25 evidenced by the photograph below of its celebrity president Mykhajlo
27 Poplavsky performing alongside students in a showcase review (Fig. 2).

15 Although explicitly ideological courses have been removed (to be replaced
17 in a sense with proudly nationalistic courses on Ukrainian history, culture,
19 and language), the curriculum is still skewed toward giving students a
21 grounding in the content of different subject fields such as history, literature,
23 and foreign languages rather than dealing in-depth with the specialist
25 knowledge and skills required to function in a modern library. And, since
27



39 Fig. 2. The Kyiv National University of Arts and Culture's Singing President,
M. Poplavsky. Source: <http://www.knukim.edu.ua/rector.htm>

1 the degrees are at the undergraduate level, students cannot necessarily be
2 expected to have satisfied general education requirements and mastered at
3 least one specialist area before entering library education as is the case for
4 those entering an American MLIS program.

5 The field of study is known officially as “Spezialnist 6.020100:
6 Knyhoznastvo, Biblioteka, Bibliographia” which may be translated literally
7 as “Bibliography, Librarianship and Reference” but which I shall refer to
8 below simply as librarianship. At the universities granting bachelor’s
9 degrees, including the Kyiv National University of Arts and Culture, Ivan
10 Franko Lviv National University, and Khrkiv National University, a
11 Master’s Degree in librarianship was introduced as an option for graduate
12 studies. The Master’s degree requires an additional two years of study after
13 completing a four-year Bachelor’s degree. The fifth year of study grants a
14 “specialist level” qualification, and the Master’s degree follows after a sixth
15 year. These programs are aimed primarily at students who already hold, or
16 are about to complete, a Bachelor’s degree in librarianship (a contrast with
17 the North American model). The specialist qualification serves in practice to
18 add back the fifth year of study present in the Soviet undergraduate degree
19 but removed during curricular reform postindependence. The specialist
20 qualification is expected for department heads in larger libraries and for
21 librarians working in specialized technical institutions. It includes a
22 significant fieldwork component.

23 Master’s degrees did not exist under the Soviet system, but have rapidly
24 gained popularity in many fields as a new and Western-oriented qualifica-
25 tion. They symbolize Ukraine’s participation in the “Bologna Process,” a
26 major European initiative to restructure higher education, improve quality
27 standards, and give greater international transferability of qualifications. The
28 Master’s degree in librarianship is intended to prepare students for man-
29 agement positions in libraries, scientific research positions, and educational
30 roles. The Master’s degrees include advanced courses on all aspects of libra-
31 rianship, including theoretical areas, technological skills, and courses aimed
32 at practical professional issues such as managing and marketing libraries.

33 Ukraine has retained its dual level German-inspired system, separating
34 Candidate of Sciences from Doctor. Since its independence, several
35 Ukrainian universities and institutions opened postgraduate studies for
36 Candidate of Sciences and Doctoral degrees. A number of Aspiranturas
37 (graduate studies programs) opened in independent Ukraine. As in Soviet
38 times, graduate studies in librarianship exist as a specialized component
39 within more general areas such as history, pedagogy, and technology. Since
40 1998, more than 70 students have received the Candidate of Sciences degree

1 with specializations in librarianship. For instance, the Vernadsky National
Library of Ukraine, its leading scientific library, reopened its Aspirantura
3 in 1993. It offers such specialized courses for doctoral students in
librarianship within two tracks: (1) Book, Librarianship, and Reference
5 and (2) Automated Control Systems and Progressive Information Technol-
ogies. Students interested in the former would usually enroll for graduate
7 degrees in history or pedagogy, perhaps at the Kyiv National University of
Arts and Culture. The second stream is usually integrated with a graduate
9 degree in Technical Sciences. The Kharkiv State Academy of Culture started
offering a Candidate of Sciences degree program with a specialization in
11 Librarianship and Bibliography in 1994 and a Doctor degree program in
1996 (Sheyko & Kushnarenko, 2004).

13

15

CURRENT SITUATION IN UKRAINIAN LIBRARY EDUCATION: TWO STEPS FORWARD

17

19 The development of modern library education in Ukraine remains very
much a work in progress. But a new connection between libraries and
21 information science is an example of the progressive thinking that is
gradually spreading among Ukrainian colleges and universities. Despite
23 this, Ukraine's librarians are not all well prepared for current and future
demands. Most currently practicing librarians, particularly at senior levels,
25 were trained under the Soviet system. Library work is not well paid, and the
profession does not have a high profile among young people. Even those
27 being educated today are largely studying under an educational system
shaped by the Soviet experience.

29

Most of the existing libraries are specialized, whereas library education in
the higher degree institutes is geared toward general public libraries. This
31 has created a mismatch between existing demands from the job market and
the preparation provided to the workforce. In many cases, the training and
33 experience of a credentialed librarian does not correspond to the demands of
the job. Library managers complain that recent graduates need a lengthy
35 training period to prepare fully to meet their job responsibilities (Mozyrko,
2002).

37

To address these problems, library schools of all tiers started changing
their curricula. Today, several universities offer a specialization in
39 "Bibliography, Librarianship, and Reference" intended to prepare gradu-
ates for the following professions: "bibliographer, manager of information

1 systems and technologies, international information manager, information
manager, abstracting and indexing analyst, records management specialist,
3 abstracting and indexing specialist of subject-based information services
systems” (Kushnarenko & Solianyuk, 2001; Zhuk, 2004). The Kyiv National
5 University of Culture made its first steps in this direction during the
1991–1992 academic year when an archives specialty was added to the
7 library degree. In 1993, a course on Foundations of Bibliographic Control
was also added, and, in 1994, a new specialization in Documents and
9 Information Services appeared (Konyukova, 2002a).

The Kharkiv State Academy of Culture provides another example of the
11 conceptual restructuring of LIS education. In 1994, the Library Faculty at
the Kharkiv State Academy of Culture was renamed the Faculty of
13 Librarianship and Informatics. The faculty was reorganized to include the
Department of Librarianship, the Department of Bibliography, the Depart-
15 ment of Document Management, and the Department of Informatics,
Information Systems, and Processes. In 1995, this school became the first in
17 Ukraine to offer the new specialization of “Record Management and
Information Services” (Sheyko & Kushnarenko, 2004). This attempt to link
19 library education to management and information work outside traditional
libraries is quite new for Ukraine and follows the model of Western
21 education in LIS science.

Education in library science was traditionally focused on the humanities
23 (history, literature, Marxist-Leninist philosophy). Library science education
is gradually acquiring a new focus that reflects the conditions of the new
25 information-oriented society. Information technology courses have been
added to the core curricula at Ukraine’s leading centers of library education
27 (Matvienko, 2000). As in the rest of the world, libraries in Ukraine have been
shifting their attention to electronic sources, audio recordings, and other
29 media resources. This has been accompanied by a new focus on information
technology in library education (Filipova, 2001; Shvakina, 2001).

31 Another important driving force is the inclusion of new technologies
(computer and telecommunications) in the processing of documents,
33 document preservation, information search, and information exchange by
using new technologies. “Due to the new technologies, the library transforms
35 itself from a book storage into a social institution that ensures accumulation
and preservation of knowledge to be widely used” (Khlynova, 2001).

37 Meanwhile, the ideological Marxist courses in the curriculum have been
replaced with a new focus on Ukraine, including such disciplines as
39 Ukrainian history, Ukrainian literature, and the “Culture of the Ukrainian
language.” Under the Soviet system, Ukrainian culture was presented as a

1 lesser derivative of Russian culture, and Ukrainian history was taught very
2 selectively. Even the grammar of the Ukrainian language was modified to
3 make it more similar to the Russian language (Bilaniuk, 2005). Ukrainian
4 national sentiment was actively discouraged. Therefore, it is important in
5 the new democratic Ukraine to prepare qualified professionals who both
6 respect their profession and are proud of their heritage. “Reforms in the
7 Library education happen when history of Ukraine, culture and literature of
8 Ukraine, culture of Ukrainian language are taught; when previously banned
9 pages of history of Ukrainian librarianship, book, and bibliography are
10 told” (Mozyrko, 2002).

11 **THE USER PERSPECTIVE: ONE STEP BACK**

12
13
14
15 These shifts in the educational curricula have been accompanied by a more
16 general shift in the role of the library within Ukrainian society. Whereas, in
17 Soviet times, libraries were required to restrict and filter the flow of
18 information, their stated mission is now to facilitate and expand infor-
19 mation usage (Apshay, 2004). Librarians are beginning to see themselves as
20 part of the cycle of information distribution from author to publisher to
21 libraries and information centers, and, finally, to users (Kostenko & Soroka,
22 2002). Two specialists in the Vernadsky Library in Kyiv captured this new
23 spirit when they wrote

24
25 The Ukrainian Library System is a part of the world’s information resources and
26 cultural heritage . . . Libraries must take responsibilities of collecting, organizing, and
27 storing electronic information resources accessible to everyone . . . Libraries must take it
28 upon themselves to implement the digitization of the whole book heritage of the
29 Ukrainian people. Providing access to these Ukrainian resources to all users, without
30 restrictions on time or location, will ensure preservation and active use of these resources
31 to solve scientific, educational, and cultural problems. (Kostenko & Soroka, 2002)

32 In practice, this fundamental shift in the culture of librarianship is taking
33 place slowly. Despite the shifts in library rhetoric from information control
34 to information access and a user focus, and despite the shifts in library
35 education curricula to reflect that rhetoric, changes in personnel and
36 leadership practices are very gradual. My personal experience as a library
37 user during my Fulbright fellowship award in 2007 gave me an opportunity
38 to compare rhetoric with reality. My decision to use a trip to the library as a
39 tool to research the library itself as well as the topics I was reading about
reflect a recent focus in the study of organizational information systems
(Yates & Maanen, 2001), on the one hand, and science and technology

1 studies (Oudshoorn & Pinch, 2003) on the other, on user experiences as a
2 key means of analyzing socio-technical systems and a valuable corrective to
3 traditional top-down methods of understanding.

4 Initially, I visited the Vernadsky Library as a guest of one of its staff
5 members, meeting its staff and surveying its departments and operations.
6 I was given a tour of modern facilities in the library. The library has extensive
7 collections of scientific literature, copies of all Ukrainian publications, many
8 special and archival collections, and several reading halls equipped with
9 computers. To Fig 3. (reference here) sic information abroad, the library
10 subscribes to many, among them *Science Direct* and
11 *Ebsco*. Within Ukraine it has pioneered online catalogs, electronic databases,
12 electronic indexing of dissertation abstracts, and electronic access to articles
13 in full text (Fig. 3).

14 Impressed by this spectacle of technology, efficiency, and customer
15 service, I decided to return to conduct research for my forthcoming article
16 on the Ukrainian library system. I had selected 10 relevant journal article
17 citations and planned to acquire full text copies for my research. I arrived at
18 10 a.m. to the library hoping to accomplish the task before lunch with a
19 colleague on the library's staff.

20 As the first step in what proved to be long process of acquiring copies of
21 the needed articles, I had to queue up for 15 min in the library lobby to



22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
Fig. 3. Reading Hall Equipped with Computers. Photograph by Author.

1 register for a pass. The library is not open to the public. Passes are issued to
provide access according to status. Students with suitable letters of intro-
3 duction receive limited access, with additional privileges provided for faculty
and for distinguished scientists. For my pass, I had to present a passport and
5 proof of having earned my doctorate – in my case it was letter from the
Fulbright office. This entitled me to a special foreigner pass, enabling me to
7 browse and request materials but not to borrow them. I had to stand in line
for 40 min before my application was approved.

9 I then tried to enter the library beyond the lobby, but I was stopped
because I did not register my laptop. Use of registered laptops is permitted,
11 but only when operated under battery power. A policy that laptops cannot
be plugged in to the plentiful power outlets is in place that is rather
13 unfriendly to researchers by American standards, and I have since been told
that this policy exists to discourage the use of personal laptops connected to
15 the network to download masses of text from commercial databases, and
thereby running up large bills for the library. Scanners and cameras may not
17 be used in the library. Registering the laptop yielded another pass
authorizing its passage into the library. I noticed that the lobby and other
19 common areas lacked seats or other points for social congregation.

I also was issued a “control ticket” of my own which I had to present at
21 each entrance to a different room as I was moving within the library. The
control ticket was stamped in each room by attendants stationed at the door
23 of each of its 16 reading rooms. At the end of the day, I had to return it with
a trail of stamps from the reading halls I had visited during my visit.

25 After receiving permission to enter the library, my first step was to go to the
card catalog to retrieve call numbers for the publications I wanted. I struggled
27 with the unfamiliar catalog system and politely asked for help from one of
two idling librarians chatting nearby (Fig. 4). I was taken aback by the rude
29 response “What? Do you want me to search the catalog for you? Here are the
cards, go and find it yourself.” Senior library staff later explained that the
31 frontline personnel are significantly underpaid and suggested that this might
explain their attitude. This recalls the classic Soviet-era aphorism, “They
33 pretend to pay us, and we pretend to work.” Generations of communist party
rule left the USSR with one of the world’s worst customer service cultures,
35 and, in libraries, as in shops, hotels, offices, and restaurants most Ukrainians
are accustomed to being treated as annoyances. However, I did find the call
37 numbers for two journals. The next step was to obtain a request form to
retrieve the appropriate issues. For each requested item (i.e., a single journal
39 issue), a library patron must complete a form in duplicate. A patron can
submit a maximum of four requests every two hours.



Fig. 4. Chatting Librarians in the Card Catalog Room. Photograph by Author.

Fig.5 reference here

While waiting for two hours to receive the first batch of journals and to file another request, I went to the current periodicals room seeking one of the current articles. I got my ticket stamped and retrieved one journal issue. Fortunately I had the right kind of pass since a prominent sign at the desk warned that only those with permanent library cards would be served there. However, even those patrons trusted with a recent journal issue cannot make copies of articles themselves, an echo of Soviet times in which photocopiers were carefully guarded and every copy made had to be authorized and accounted for to limit the spread of samizdat materials. The only legal way to copy an article is to leave the reading room and join the line in the basement to submit a copy request. In the middle of the day, I was lucky to wait only 20 min. Later in the day, queues were much longer. Although the logs of materials copied are no longer tallied they have persisted out of institutional habit (Fig. 5).

When I met my Ukrainian colleague, he revealed the existence of a computer catalog of call numbers covering materials from 1994 onward, so I no longer needed to struggle through the card catalog anymore. Searching the catalog required determination, as the librarian on duty in the computer room wanted to know exactly what I was planning to do on the computer and then insisted that I would not find what I needed. Fortunately, the system worked well and saved me much time. By then, my first four journal issues had arrived in the reading room. I had time to repeat the cycle once more before the library closed at 6 p.m.: submitting request forms, waiting



Fig. 5. At the Current Periodicals Desk the Librarian is Obscured Completely Behind a Large Sign Warning that Controls Tickets Must be Shown on Entry and that Users without Permanent Library Cards will not be Served. Photograph by Author.

to retrieve the journals, and queuing up to make copies. Unfortunately, the copy room closed an hour earlier than the library. Hiding behind a pillar in the lobby, I used my camera to photograph the text of the retrieved articles. After eight hours in the library, I had found seven journal articles and had copied just three of them legally. To accomplish this I had filled out 15 forms, and received four stamps on my control ticket (Fig. 6).

The contrast between the bold hopes expressed in the articles I retrieved and the process by which I procured them was jarring. The articles depicted a determined drive to open library collections to a broader population of researchers, to create user-focused culture, and to provide access to information. Technology to provide this change is available in Ukraine, and has been deployed more extensively in the Vernadsky than in any other library. However, the practices and assumptions of the Soviet era are embedded in many aspects of the library: its physical organization, service culture, limitation of access by user type, and proliferation of forms and permits. Librarians were more concerned with limiting access than facilitating it, actively discouraging the use of its ballyhooed electronic resources. To Western eyes, this library appeared hugely overstaffed, yet the staff



Fig. 6. A Selection of Forms Accumulated After a Day of Library Use. Photograph by Author.

members seemed to resent the presence of library patrons as an intrusion on their routine. The Soviet-style control forms required to enter each room and stamped to log the patron's every move, provided particularly striking evidence of this micro-level continuity of practice despite a polar reversal of official ideology. This was also evidenced by the centralization of copy machines and the barriers to their use confronting users.

CONCLUSION

Attempts to restructure Ukrainian library education remain at the experimental stage, with different approaches coexisting among the country's institutions of library education. Impressive efforts are underway to shift structures of LIS education toward Western European models, including the introduction of master's degrees and a more modular approach to course requirements. Explicitly ideological courses have been removed, but Soviet culture, assumptions, and practices continue to exert their influence in a subtle way. Although new approaches are being taught, they have had a limited impact on practice as real change in the service philosophy await the creation of a new generation of information professionals. My examination of the actual user experience at the country's most advanced library showed that shifts in rhetoric and an impressive

1 commitment to the adoption of international electronic resources have yet
2 to fully shift practices from the ingrained habits of the Soviet era.

3 Institutional cultures and practices can perpetuate themselves indefinitely.
4 So far, the Vernadsky's institutional inertia has imposed its own patterns on
5 the use of new technology, rather than being somehow transformed by the
6 mere presence of computers, Internet connections, and databases. Yet my
7 own opinion is that change is coming to Ukrainian libraries, albeit slowly.
8 The new curriculum foregrounds electronic resources, and many Ukrainians
9 are enthusiastic about the potential of open access digital libraries and
10 journals for this relatively poor country. Within the country's largest
11 libraries transformation may take place slowly, as a younger generation
12 currently in mid-level positions gradually takes over. Smaller, more nimble
13 libraries may be adapting more quickly, in terms of organizational culture if
14 not in their technological infrastructure. Traveling the country in 2007 as
15 part of my Fulbright fellowship, I was impressed by the commitment shown
16 by many regional library directors to improve user services and make the
17 physical layout of their libraries more welcoming. Improvising in an
18 environment of scarce resources they recognized the importance of libraries
19 as community centers and public institutions in a newly capitalist world.
20 Struggling for survival has forced them to care about their users in a manner
21 unimaginable during the Soviet era. For many smaller libraries the choice is
22 between rapid evolution and extinction.

23 Ukrainian library educators face many of the same challenges and
24 opportunities as their American counterparts, but they must guard against
25 the assumption that the imposition of an American-style reliance on
26 graduate MLIS education is the only way forward. In the longer term, **AU:2**
27 appropriate education for Ukraine's librarians will depend on the young
28 nation's conception of what the purpose and mission of a library should be.
29 Although Ukrainian library culture continues to reflect Soviet heritage, it
30 already diverged dramatically from those prevalent in Putin's authoritarian
31 Russia. I noticed at a recent major library conference in Crimea (14th
32 International Conference "Crimea 2007: The Role of Digital Information
33 and Digital Libraries in Advance to the Knowledge-Based Society") that
34 Russian participants often began presentations by personally thanking
35 Vladimir Vladimirovich Putin for his leadership and nurturing of libraries, a
36 direct echo of Soviet rhetorical practice unknown in today's Ukraine.
37 Ukrainian presenters at the same conference openly debated shortcomings
38 and challenges with a well-founded skepticism toward the capabilities of
39 their own government. As time passes, the shape of Ukraine's information
40 institutions will both reflect and shape the efforts of its people to forge a

1 consensus as to whether the Ukraine will finally be a liberal European
 3 democracy, a loyal satellite of a resurgent Russia, or something uniquely
 5 Ukrainian.

7 REFERENCES

- 9 Abramov, K. I. (1974). *Bibliotechnoye Stroitelstvo v Pervye Gody Sovetskoi Vlasti (1917–1920)*
 (*Building libraries during the first years of the Soviet power (1917–1920)*). Moskva: Kniga.
- 11 Abramov, K. I. (1980). *Istoria BD (Bibliotechnogo Dela) v SSSR (History of librarianship in the*
USSR) (3rd ed., p. 351). Moskva: Kniga.
- 13 Apshay, N. (2004). Strategichni Zasady Rozvytku Bibliotek Vyschykh Navchalnykh Zakladiv
 (Strategic directions of higher education library development in the context of
 informatization). *Visnyk Knyzhkovoi Palaty* (6), 23–25.
- 15 Bilaniuk, L. (2005). *Contested tongues: Language politics and cultural correction in Ukraine*.
 Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- 17 Biriukov, B. V. (2000). *Repressirovannaya Kniga: Istoki Yavlenia (Repressed book: Sources of*
origin) (pp. 87–122). Moskva: Homo Legens.
- 19 Choldin, M. T. (1976). The Russian Bibliographical Society, 1889–1930. *Library Quarterly*,
 46(January), 1–19.
- 21 Daniel, A. (2005). Istoki i Smysl Sovetskogo Samizdata (Sources and meaning of Soviet
 Samisdat). In: V. V. Egrunov (Ed.), *Antologiya Samizdata. Nepodcenzurnaya literatura v*
SSSR. 1950–1980. (Anthology of samizdat: Underground literature in the USSR,
1950s–1980s). Moskva: International Institute of Humanities and Political Research.
- 23 Demchyna, L. I. (2003). Strukturuvannia Dyszcyplin Dokumentalno-Komunikacijnoho
 Zycklu v Umovakh Stupenevii Bibliotechno-Informacijnoi Oscvity (Structuring of
 the document management and communication courses in the conditions of tiered
 25 library and information education). *Visnyk Kharkivskoi Derzhavnoi Akademii Kultury*
(Kharkiv State Culture Academy Bulletin), 2003(11), 114–118.
- 27 Filipova, L. Y. (2001). Bibliotechni Resursy Internet dlja Naukovykh Doslidzen (Library
 Internet resources for scientific research). In: B. Nauka (Ed.), *Osvita, Profesia u*
 29 *Demokratychnij Ukraini: Zbirnyk Naukovykh Prac (Library science, education,*
profession in democratic Ukraine): Collection of scientific works (Vol. 3, pp. 98–105).
 Kyiv: KDUKIM.
- 31 Golovko, A. G. (2003). Organizacii ta Metodologichni Chynnyky Kompyuterizacii
 Bibliotechno-Informacijnykh Navchalnykh Dyszcyplin (Organization and methodol-
 33 ogy of computerization of the library-information education disciplines. *Visnyk*
Kharkivskoi Derzhavnoi Akademii Kultury (Kharkiv State Culture Academy Bulletin),
 2003(11), 119–123.
- 35 Grigoryev, Y. G. (1975). Bibliotechno-Bibliographicheskoye Obrazovanie, Sistema Podgotovki
 Bibliotekarey i Bibliographov Vysshey i Sredney Kvalifikacii. (Library and library-
 37 reference education, system for preparing librarians and reference specialists with higher
 and middle education qualifications). Moskva.
- 39 Karetzky, S. (2002). *Not seeing red: American librarianship and the Soviet Union, 1917–1960*.
 Lanham, MD: University Press of America.

- 1 Kazanzceva, L. V. (1958). *Razvitie Bibliotechnogo Obrazovania v SSSR (Development of the*
2 *library education in the U.S.S.R.)*. In *40 Let Bibliotechnogo Stroitelstva v SSSR (40 years*
3 *of library construction in the U.S.S.R.)*. Moskva: Znanie.
- 4 Khlynova, N.F. (2001). Bibliotechna Polityka na Suchasnomy Etapi (Library policy on the
5 current stage). In: *Programy Rozvytku Regioniv i Bibliotechno-Informazcijna Polityka*
6 *(Programs for development regions and library-information policy)* (pp. 30–38). Kyiv:
7 DAKKKIM.
- 8 Kimmage, D. (1992). *Russian libraries in transition: An anthology of glasnost literature*.
9 Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Co.
- 10 Konyukova, I. Y. (2002a). Rozvytok Bibliotechnoi Profesii v Ukraini: Sychasni Konzhepczii
11 ta Napryamy (Development of library profession in Ukraine: Current concepts and
12 trends). Unpublished Thesis for “Kandidat Pedahohichnykh Nauk” (Candidate of
13 Pedagogical Sciences), Kyiv National University of Culture and Arts, Kyiv, Ukraine.
- 14 Konyukova, I. Y. (2002b). Rozvytok Bibliotechnoi Profesii v Ukraini: za Pidsumkamy
15 Doslidzhennia 2000–2002 Rokiv. (Development of library profession in Ukraine:
16 Results of a study 2000–2002). In: *Bibliotechna Nauka, Osvita, Profesiya u*
17 *Demokratychniy Ukraini: Zbirnyk Naykovykh Prazc. (Library science, education,*
18 *profession in democratic Ukraine): Collection of scientific works* (4, pp. 50–57). Kyiv:
19 KDUKIM.
- 20 Kostenko, L. Y., & Soroka, M. B. (2002). Biblioteka Informazciynogo Suspilstva (Library of an
21 information society). *Bibliotechnyi Visnyk (Library Bulletin)*, 2002(3), 33–38.
- 22 Krupskaya, N. K. (1934). Foreword. In: *Chto Pisal i Govoril Lenin o Bibliotekakh (What Lenin*
23 *wrote and said about libraries)* (p. 4). Moskva: Gosizdat.
- 24 Kushnarenko, N. M., & Solianyuk, A. A. (2001). Bibliotechno-Informazcijna Osvita: Perekhid u
25 **AU** 4
26 Novu Yakist (Library and information science education: Shifting to new quality). In:
27 *Bibliotechna Nauka, Osvita, Profesia u Demokratychnij Ukraini: Zbirnyk Naukovykh*
28 *Prazc (Library science, education, profession in democratic Ukraine): Collection of*
29 *Scientific Works* (Vol. 3, pp. 46–50). Kyiv.
- 30 Likhtenshtein, E. S. (1978). *Slovo O Nauke (Word about science)* (p. 237). Moskva: Znanie.
- 31 Matvienko, O. V. (2000). Pidgotovka Specialistiv z Informazciynoi Diyalnosti v Galuzi
32 Virtualnykh Komunikaciy (Preparation of specialists in the area of virtual commu-
33 nication). In: *Bibliotechna Nauka, Osvita, Profesiya u Demokratychniy Ukraini: Zbirnyk*
34 *Naykovykh Prazc. (Library science, education, profession in democratic Ukraine):*
35 *Collection of scientific works* (Vol. 2, pp. 46–54). Kyiv: KDUKIM.
- 36 Mozyrko, L. E. (2000). Vyscha Bibliotechno-Informaciyna Osvita Ukrainy (Higher library and
37 information science education in Ukraine). In: *Bibliotechna Nauka, Osvita, Profesiya u*
38 *Demokratychniy Ukraini: Zbirnyk Naykovykh Prazc. (Library science, education,*
39 *profession in democratic Ukraine): Collection of scientific works* (Vol. 2, pp. 61–66).
Kyiv: KDUKIM.
- 39 Mozyrko, L. E. (2002). Reorganizatsiya Bibliotechno-Informaciynoi Osvity v Kyiivskomu
Natsionalnomu Universyteti Kultury i Mystezctv: 2000–2002. (Reorganization of
library and information science education in Kyiv National University of Culture and
Arts: 2000–2002). In: *Bibliotechna Nauka, Osvita, Profesiya u Demokratychniy Ukraini:*
Zbirnyk Naykovykh Prazc. (Library science, education, profession in democratic
Ukraine): Collection of scientific works (Vol. 4, pp. 130–137). Kyiv: KDUKIM.
- Oleneva, Z. P. (1961). Stanovlenie i Razvitiye Vysshego Bibliotechnogo Obrazovania v SSSR.
(Establishment and development of the higher library education in the U.S.S.R.)

- 1 Leningrad: Izdatelstvo Leningradskogo Bibliotechnogo Instituta imeni N.K. Krupskoy
(Leningrad Library Krupskaya Institute Press).
- 3 Oudshoorn, N. E., & Pinch, T. (Eds). (2003). *How users matter: The co-construction of users and
technology*. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press.
- 5 Raymond, B. (1979). *Krupskaia and Soviet Russian librarianship, 1917–1939*. Metuchen, NJ:
Scarecrow Press.
- 7 Sheyko, V., & Kushnarenko, N. M. (2004). Kharkivska Vyshcha Shkola Bibliotechno-
Informacynoi ta Knygoznavchoii Osvity (Kharkiv Higher Education School of
Library, Reference and Information in the context of past and present). *Visnyk
Knyzhkovoii Palaty* (7), 29–33.
- 9 Shvakina, E. V. (2001). Avtomatizirovannaya Bibliotechnaya Sistema Donezckogo Nazcyo-
nalnogo Universiteta (Automated library information systems of the Donetsk National
11 University). In: *Virtualnye Biblioteki* (pp. 29–38). Kyiv: DAKKKIM.
- 13 Verzhbizkiy, H. (1924). *Trud i Kniga (Labor and book)* (2nd ed.). Moskva: Gosizdat.
- 15 Yates, J., & Maanen, J. V. (Eds). (2001). *Information technology and organizational
transformation: History, rhetoric, and practice*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- 17 Zhuk, V. M. (2004). Problemy Pidgotovky Specialistiv Specialnosti “Knyga, Biblioteko-
navstvo, Bibliogrphiya” (Problems in preparing specialists in “Book, Librarianship,
Reference”). Paper presented at the Zvitna Naukova Konferenzcia Vykladachiv,
Aspirantiv, Spivrobotnykiv i Studentiv RDGU, 20–22 Kvitnia 2004 (Report Science
19 Conference Held for Faculty, Doctoral Candidates, and Students in Rivne State
University, 20–22 April 2004), Rivne, Ukraine.
- 21
- 23
- 25
- 27
- 29
- 31
- 33
- 35
- 37
- 39